
This is a penetrating, gracefully written and solidly researched account of a rarely discussed and little understood institution: the Scottish communion rites which flourished from the early seventeenth century to the early decades of the nineteenth. An important feature of the Scottish church, they also played a large but hitherto unrecognized role in the creation of the American evangelical tradition.

Both traditional and ethnographic approaches are used: the first and last chapters describe, respectively, the origins and the decline of the communion rites, while the two middle chapters explore the social meaning of the rituals and the mental worlds of their participants. Schmidt demonstrates that when the Reformation destroyed the traditional Catholic approaches to Communion it left a popular hunger for public rituals which was filled in large measure by these extraordinary events. Occurring during the Summer and Fall they drew huge crowds and usually lasted for four days. They frequently became the focus of religious revivals and were a crucial expression of popular religious devotion: attempts in the seventeenth century to suppress them proved futile and provoked a furious response.

An impressive array of sources is used, the most striking being accounts of the spiritual experiences of 108 people who took part in the great revivals at Cambuslang in the 1740's. Originally collected with an eye to their being edited and printed for the edification of a wider audience, these 1200 pages never got past the point of being gone over by a group of ministers who marked certain passages for deletion. In consequence we have not only the full original record, but also an insight into which material was considered unseemly by the evangelical ministers.

By the late eighteenth century these communions were under attack, with the best known barbs coming from Robert Burns in his satire *The Holy Fair.* Accusations that the communion festivals were havens of superstition, hypocrisy and immorality came from others as well and were in part a manifestation of the Scottish Enlightenment's rejection of traditional religious be-
liefs. The Victorians continued the assault, stressing the economic losses caused by attendance at these lengthy festivals and the rowdy, indecorous, lower-class conviviality—often accompanied by drinking—which marked them.

The most lasting legacy of the communion festivals came in America, where Scottish settlers had recreated them in almost perfect miniature. Schmidt demonstrates the important role they played not only in the Great Awakening in the 1740’s but also in the great revival at Cane Ridge in 1801, which set in motion a spectacular series of similar events. In adopting Scottish models, however, the Americans also adapted them, and in the process rendered them almost unrecognizable. Where the focus of the Scottish service had been the eucharist, the American revival came to centre on the drama of individual conversion. Ironically the American form of revival in time came to Scotland, and helped to undermine the tradition from which it had sprung.

This book, the winner of the Frank S. and Elizabeth D. Brewer Prize of the American Society of Church History, is a major addition to our knowledge of an important and influential expression of popular religious belief. It should be required reading for those studying religion or popular culture in this period.

KEITH CASSIDY

UNIVERSITY OF GUELPH


Until recently, the history of women and sexuality in Scotland has not been well-served by Scottish historians. Fortunately, this has changed with the advent of what is referred to as the ‘new’ social history of Scotland. Works by Rosalind Mitchison, Leah Leneman, Linda Mahood, Eleanor Gordon, Sian Reynolds and Esther Breitenbach have provided much-needed insight into the worlds of Scottish women in the eighteenth, nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. While much more remains to be done, these works contribute to filling the lacunæ of much of Scottish social history.
Andrew Blaikie’s recent book is a welcome addition to this small, but essential field. Referring to his study as an “historical investigation of the social context of bastardy...” (p. 5), Blaikie utilizes a variety of sources to analyze sexual relations in late eighteenth and nineteenth century northeast Scotland. Although contemporaries assumed that bastardy was a consequence of industrialization and urbanization, after the 1858 publication of the annual report of the Registrar General for Scotland (which included the first regional indices for bastardy), it became clear that illegitimacy was a rural phenomenon concentrated in particular regions of the country. Both the northeast and southwestern peninsula had a high incidence of illegitimacy and Banffshire, in particular, had the highest rate from 1861 to 1921. The results of the report led to a moral panic about sex and a determination to uncover the cause of the ‘Great Sin of Banffshire.’

Blaikie’s work is a micro-study of one such ‘sinful’ parish, Rothiemay. Using a variety of sociological-historical models, the author reconstructs a demographic and socio-economic profile of this farming community. Birth registers, census data, Old Parish Registers, Kirk Session records and General Registers of the Poor are used to apply family reconstitution to Rothiemay. In the process, Blaikie uncovers some interesting conclusions. From 1775 there was a drastic change in agrarian society as opportunities for individual family formation regressed. Young women and men worked away from the parental home but were less able to set up their own independent households. As a result, the opportunity to marry “...depended less upon the level of earnings than on the prospects of acquiring a croft.” (p. 217) Although pre-marital sex was common among the labouring classes, changing economic conditions determined whether or not a child would be born shortly after marriage or outside of it. Thus, when accommodation for small tenants became scarcer and the probability of marriage was reduced, illegitimacy increased. Bastardy was also particular to a life-cycle stage when young women and men were outwith parental surveillance.

Blaikie furnishes some fascinating insights into the social milieu in which illegitimacy functioned. Far from being ostracized by the community, he notes that most illegitimate children
lived with their grandparents. In addition, the public censure of the kirk session began to decline in the early nineteenth century so that public appearances in front of the congregation were replaced by private confessions to the minister. In Rothiemay, he concludes, there was a genuine sympathy towards unwed mothers. Thus, material circumstances, rather than cultural factors, were the most important determinants of illegitimacy in northeastern Scotland.

This study complements the work of Mitchison and Leneman on illegitimacy and sexual relations in seventeenth and eighteenth century Scotland. Blaikie’s thorough examination of a northeastern parish generates important conclusions about rural Scottish society during the age of industrialization. This work, however, is not for the general reader. Sociological jargon tends to obscurate relevant points. In addition, the price will also keep this book out of the hands of interested scholars. Nonetheless, this work is an important addition to the study of gender and sexuality in modern Scotland. One can only hope that medieval and early modern Scottish historians will soon emulate their modern colleagues.

MARGARET McINTYRE
TRENT UNIVERSITY


This interesting collection of essays was written in honor of professor John Butt from the Department of History at the University of Strathclyde. What makes this volume unique is each of the contributors were either an undergraduate or postgraduate in the History Department at Strathclyde and, therefore, all have been influenced in some way by Professor Butt.

Professor Butt pioneered the discipline of industrial archaeology in Scotland, the purpose of which is to gain an understanding of the industrialization process and its effect on society through analyzing the historical remains of industrial developments and/or their legal records. The volume is divided into two parts: the first section is composed of seven articles which focus
on Scotland's early industrial development; and the second section (five papers) analyzes the impact early industrialization had on Scottish society.

As an economist I found the first set of essays very enlightening. Too many economists expend their energy on theoretical issues without looking at the historical facts, and several of the case studies suggest some interesting paradoxes for economic theorists. For example, Tom Donnelly's piece on granite manufacturing in Aberdeen implies that competition may not always lead to a social optimum:

The basic truth is that from the turn of the century there were too many firms trying to compete in a market insufficiently strong to support all of them. Indeed from 1904 one can detect the beginnings of the industry's long drawn out decline as press report after report referred to the problems of continuous and ruinous price cutting and of excess capacity in the industry (p. 95).

The net result of this "destructive" competition was the eventual demise of the granite industry in Scotland.

I found the second set of essays even more intriguing than the first. While none of the authors made this explicit reference, the impact of industrialization on Glasgow at the turn of the 19th Century has some haunting parallels to modern political and social problems facing the U.S. For example, in "Urbanisation and the Civic Response: Glasgow, 1800-30," T.M. Devine chronicles the response of the ruling classes to the social problems created by rapid industrialization and urbanization. On fiscal problems, "by the 1820s and 1830s one senses more a concern with controlling expenditures than with tackling the huge problems of a rapidly growing city (my emphasis)." On political control, "By the 1820s committed Evangelicals were consolidating their grip on the Town Council"—the rise of the religious right? On the cause of social decay, "The belief was that a root cause of moral decline was intemperance"—substitute drugs for intemperance here. On the vagrancy problem, "The assumption was that vagrants (substitute welfare recipients here) had fallen into difficulties through their own fault and had then
become parasites on the benevolence of others. A punitive and rigorous approach was therefore adopted.” Somewhere in this essay I expected to find a quote from the historical equivalent of Newt Gingrich stating that the cause of these social ills was “failed liberal policies.” However, the conclusion, also relevant to the contemporary debate, is that the social ills were more a consequence of economic problems than moral ones.

While readers will find, as I did, many points of disagreement and some weaknesses throughout the text, they will also find that the discipline of industrial archaeology is a valuable resource for historical studies across the social sciences, and that the contributions from this text far outweigh its weaknesses.

TED P. SCHMIDT
BUFFALO STATE COLLEGE


Alexander Nicolson (1884-1966) “knew the island of Skye as no-one else did”. This revised and enlarged edition of his now-classic 1930 edition includes full translations of all his Gàelic texts and provides an important reference work for all students of Highland history in general and the Isle of Skye in particular. Quite apart from his considerable personal knowledge of the island and its history, Nicolson was also a major Gàelic scholar and in fact produced a textbook of Gàelic grammar in 1936. His considerable researches included a major study of the ancient clan bards of Skye and it is no accident that he relied on their numerous Gàelic works to provide support for the traditional stories of the clans and personalities of Skye, their lives and their characters.

It is common these days to denigrate the clan histories which rely on unverifiable stories and anecdotes. Many seem far-fetched and fall into the area of legend and tradition, rather than the severely historical. Nicolson made no apology for this and even on the title page itself he refers to these “pleasant by-paths of history” noting that they “certainly help to enliven its otherwise grave and monotonous aspect.”
It is as well that the present revised edition incorporates translations of the many original Gaelic extracts from the works of the bards since Nicolson used these sources extensively. So much so, indeed, that this volume will be of great interest to students of the Gaelic language. One can see that the original poems have a beauty and rhythm of their own. The English translations, of course, necessarily lose this vital aspect and one is left with the stark, bleak narrative deprived of all grace and harmony.

The volume is organised into eighteen chapters as well as what could be described as sub-chapters. An example of this would be Chapter VI - “Social Conditions, 1500-1600”. The sub-headings comprise: The Church; Education and Culture; Law and Order; Agriculture; Trade; Habits, Pastimes and Manner of Living; Dress; and Weapons. The Contents section alone runs to six pages, which makes it easy for the reader to find that aspect of history in which he or she is reviewing. The book commences with a chapter on prehistoric remains and progresses through time to the present day, which means the early 20th century. There is also a chapter on the history of Raasay.

This history of Skye includes many sub-chapters on the two major clans that controlled the Island, namely the Macleods and the Macdonalds. Each of the chiefs of these two clans are dealt with and this is where the anecdotal parts of the History of Skye are most evident. In 1469 John, Lord of the Isles, conferred a grant of land in Sleat to the Macdonalds and from that point the Macleods find themselves sharing their island with another major clan. The clan battles are related according to clan historians and it is noteworthy that some of the strange tales appear almost word for word among the legends of other clans in other regions which makes them highly questionable as to their validity.

As the book progresses to the 17th century there is less need for anecdotal legends. The wanderings of Bonnie Prince Charlie after the disaster at Culloden is fully related and there is no doubt that once Nicolson gets into the lifestyles of the people of Skye he is at his most interesting. The chapters where he deals with the food and drink of the population and the manner of their living come to life. Superstitions come under scrutiny. For
example the healing powers of a certain blacksmith in Kilmartin are astonishing: “Here the sufferer was laid on the anvil, face upward, while the powerful son of Vulcan raised the sledgehammer aloft and, bringing it down with tremendous force and a threatening grimace, stopped short when almost in contact with his client’s brow, “else”, as Martin has it, “he would be so sure to cure the patient of all diseases!”

On drink: “There was one article, however, in the importation of which no sparingness was observed. This was the foreign brandy, the drinking of which, together with the native whisky, made for great intemperance.” On food: “The poorer people seldom tasted any kind of meat, despite the large herds that were reared for we have it on the testimony of Martin, himself a native of the island that, “here is no place so well stored with such great quantities of good beef and mutton, where so little was consumed by eating.” And in 1850: “The prevailing disease is poverty, and the remedy is food.”

The destitution of the people of Skye is dealt with feelingly by Nicolson as he relates the great crop failures of the mid 19th century and the consequences and the resulting emigration. The clearances also come under scrutiny. The quotation from the Rev. Coll MacDonald of Portree stresses the mood of the time by some of the landlords and others: “The highest praise is due to Lord MacDonald for his liberality in this benificent work and patriotic enterprise, he having expended large sums of money in conveying the poor people on his property to America.” While one of his many quotes from the poets relates:

“Tha luchd teagasg cho beag churaim

“The preachers have so little care

Faicinn caradh mo luchd ducta

Seeing the ill treatment of my Isle’s folk,

’S iad cho balbh air anns a chubaid

And so silent about it in the pulpit

’S ged bu bruidean bha gan eisdeachd.”

As if brute beasts were listening to them.”

There were very favourable reviews when the History of Skye was published in 1930. There were also three major criticisms of the work at that time: the absence of a table of contents; the lack
of source references; the omission of translations for the Gaelic poetry and prose. Dr Maclean has attacked these defaults in this modern edition and remedied them as well as adding a number of Appendices which has enlarged the book by a quarter. The black and white photos included are another welcome addition. This is a most useful reference work.

ALAN MCKENZIE
OAKVILLE, ONTARIO


This slim volume comprises 36 pages of colour photographs of Skye and serves well as an appropriate companion to the “History of Skye,” the previously reviewed book. Whilst the latter publication has a few black and white photos to support parts of the narrative, Skye Scape exhibits an extravagant and beautiful backdrop of glorious pictures of Skye. Winter, summer, mists and seas all play their part in the visual glance over the Skye landscape—hence the title—Skye Scape.

The captions to the colourful photographs are equally colourful quotations from famous, and not so famous, persons about Skye and its people. They include quotes from the same persons mentioned frequently in Alexander Nicolson’s book: the Rev. Coll MacDonald of Portree (1841) and Martin Martin (1716). This particularly nice counterbalance of an ancient quote against a modern picture has been carefully selected. The shot of an abandoned tractor in a field against a clear blue sky captures a complaint about the difficulties of farming in 1913; including this appropriate remark: “Today is a splendid working day, but then it is Sunday! We could have finished the hay; tomorrow as likely as not we shall not be able to touch it.” Again, there is a quote from Derek Cooper (1970) against scenes of black clouds with the sun’s rays shining through: “But Skye is no longer the place it was ten years ago, and ten years from now it will no longer be the place it is today. This need not give rise to either regret or alarm or even misplaced tears of nostalgia. The beauty will be there after we are gone and long after we are gone.
the magic will remain.” Perhaps this book in its own small way preserves part of the magic of Skye.

ALAN MCKENZIE
OAKVILLE, ONTARIO


Scotland in the Nineteenth Century is a work which will greatly ease the task of the professional or amateur historian who has occasion to consult parliamentary papers for virtually any social or economic question. The difficulty hitherto in making full use of these documents is their sheer volume and the inadequacy of the existing indices suggesting what may be found in the various reports. The present work indicates clearly what sources are likely to prove useful for more detailed investigation, as, for example, in its treatment of The Report from the Select Committee on Salt Duties, 1818. The committee was appointed “to take into consideration the laws relating to the salt duties, and the means of remedying the inconveniences arising therefrom...”, but in fact most of the Scottish witnesses who appeared before the committee were concerned with the manufacture of kelp, the means of employment of so many of the inhabitants of the western and northern islands. Kelp, obtained from seaweed, was then used extensively in industrial chemistry because it did not incur the duties imposed upon salt. As one of the issues before the select committee on salt duties was the possibility of using salt in industrial processes, obviously the kelp manufacturers had a strong interest in seeing the tax on salt continue. When the salt tax was withdrawn despite their opposition the kelp industry collapsed with horrendous social consequences. Thus, the titles of the committee reports give very little indication of what may be found within them, and the real merit of this work is to bring the content of the reports into the light of day, as least as far as Scotland is concerned. Who, for example, would immediately elect to turn to The Select Committee on Contagious Diseases Act,
1882, for a detailed picture of the operation of Glasgow prostitution? The evidence taken by that committee provides such a description, highlighting the need for such a bibliographic aid.

There are errors in the bibliography. The enquiry into the collapse of the Tay Bridge is stated in the index to be found on page 317, but actually appears on page 320. The errors are, however, minor and should not detract in any way from the usefulness of the book. Every research library should obtain a copy of this book to house with their collection of parliamentary papers, and anyone engaging in research into a social or economic question relating to nineteenth century Scotland should attempt to obtain a copy, for it will save them an enormous amount of time. Accordingly a considerable debt of gratitude is due to Professor Jo Haythornthwaite of Glasgow Caledonian University and her colleagues for their painstaking and immensely useful labours.

Ronald M. Sunter  
University of Guelph


Scholars of Highland migration studies will find this thoroughly researched and clearly argued work a valuable contribution to the field. To be sure, the book is not exclusively a historical analysis of the Highland emigration to Cape Breton in the first half of the nineteenth century. Its scope is much wider and its view is much longer. Furthermore, Hornsby’s methodology is that of the historical geographer. He combines descriptions of spatial patterns in the settlement and economy of Cape Breton at given times (the “horizontal” approach, in the jargon of historical geography) with examinations of the processes through which those patterns changed (the “vertical” approach). In doing so, he contends that the most significant of these changes in Cape Breton was the massive immigration of Highland settlers between 1800 and 1845. Throughout the study, the author builds his “horizontal” accounts on the twin themes of agricultural settlement and resource (“staple”) exploitation.
The book begins with a description of Cape Breton in 1800, prior to the wave of Scottish immigration. The Island is characterized as underpopulated and agriculturally and industrially underdeveloped, dependent on nothing more than seasonal cod fishing and the embryonic coal mining and shipbuilding industries. Subsequently described and analyzed are the circumstances compelling Western Highlanders and Islanders to emigrate to Cape Breton in the first half of the nineteenth century. Most of this information will be familiar to those acquainted with Highland studies. Indeed, Hornsby constructively summarizes the existing scholarship. Logically, given the geographical perspective, he emphasizes the material context of change in the Western Highlands, assigning greater significance to economic causes of emigration, especially the collapse of the kelp industry after 1825. This date, rather than the traditionally accepted 1815, is Hornsby’s turning point, around which he structures his subsequent argument about the pattern of Scottish settlement in Cape Breton. This is convincing, despite the relatively scant attention paid to earlier influences such as changes in British policy and landlord attitudes regarding migration. Consequently, earlier emigrants (those leaving prior to 1825 and, especially, those few leaving between 1800 and 1815) are depicted as marginally prosperous tenants and crofters departing in anticipation of worsening economic circumstances. By contrast, what follows is a portrait of the destitute cottars and crofters forced out of the Highlands in large numbers because of the deteriorating economic situation and the increase in the number of clearances in the mid-1820s.

The author then provides an account of the Scottish settlement of Cape Breton. He links the pattern of settlement with the timing and character of the various episodes of emigration. He argues that the relatively comfortable pre-1825 settlers acquired the only decent agricultural land, while their poorer successors became “backlanders” and squatters. Family migration is similarly related to patterns of settlement and cultural development. By 1850, Cape Breton was definitely a Scottish island, home for thousands of Gàelic speakers bonded through kinship.

The second half of the book includes accounts of agricultural evolution and resource exploitation in the latter part of the century, ending in 1891. This is done in the context of the next
great changes in nineteenth century Cape Breton: the end of agricultural settlement, the 1840s potato famine, and subsequent emigration. These events triggered a movement of population to other parts of the Maritimes, to the Canadas, to the New England states and to the coal mining towns of eastern Cape Breton, booming by the 1860s with the help of British and American capital. They also led to a slow decline in the Highland character of the Island.

Hornsby summarizes this study by comparing the development of Cape Breton with other Maritime and, to a lesser extent, Canadian, regions. He points out convincing similarities among these areas with respect to settlement, the importance of staple trades tied to foreign capital, cultural isolation and retention, agricultural and economic stagnation and the inevitable emigration to other parts of North America.

_Nineteenth Century Cape Breton_ is a model of historical geography, clearly presented and supported by numerous, and helpful, maps, tables and archival photographs. The chapters on Scottish migration and settlement in Cape Breton incorporate the examples of many individual settlers which illustrate the main themes and make for more compelling reading. Of course, the geographical approach largely neglects other factors affecting Highland migration and Cape Breton settlement such as politics, folklore and religion. This, however, is more a criticism of the limitations of historical geography than of this notable book. It makes a valuable contribution to Scottish, and Canadian, studies.

Tom Belton
Archives of Ontario