
Lloyd Laing, senior lecturer in archaeology at the University of Nottingham, and Jenny Laing, formerly a research fellow in art history, and tutor in Roman archaeology and art at the University of Liverpool, have collaborated in the past in writing about the early history and archaeology of Celtic Britain, notably in Celtic Britain and Ireland, c. 400-1200 AD (1990). In The Picts and the Scots they focus more precisely on Scotland north of the Forth and Clyde in the period from the end of the Romans to the ninth century, when the political geography was forever changed with the creation of the kingdom of Alba (Scotland). After two chapters looking in turn at the history of the Picts and Scots there is a chapter discussing what is known of the ‘everyday life’ of Picts and Scots and the different types of settlement associated with them, followed by a final chapter on their artwork in metal and on stone and vellum.

The chief purpose of the book is to present this material in an accessible and attractive way for the student and general reader alike. It certainly succeeds to some extent: its style is economical and the text is extensively illustrated. Unfortunately, however, it has too many avoidable slips and confused or clumsy explanations. The impression it gives is that it has been put together with more haste than care. For instance, the battle of Mag Rath took place in 637 on page 42, but in 639 on the following page; we are given a false picture (I suspect because the secondary literature has been misunderstood) of the Dál Riata falling apart in the mid seventh century and being restored to unity under Ferchar Fota (d. 697); a fundamental misunderstanding of the Irish annal leads to the extraordinary assertion that Aedán mac Gabráin’s successor (Eochaid Buide, king of the Dál Riata) styled himself king of the Picts; Kenneth mac Alpin’s father’s name, we are told, is British, when in fact, it is Pictish (but not
unknown among the Dál Riata); and the discussion of Pictish royal succession, which asserts that "as things stand, the case for Pictish matriliny is not proven, and would not appear to be supported in any way by the evidence that survives" (pp. 58-9), shows no knowledge of David Sellar's brilliant review article of Alfred Smyth's *Warlords and Holy Men* ('Warlords, Holy Men and Matrilineal Succession', *Innes Review*, Vol. 36, 1985, pp. 29-43) which showed that there is, in fact, evidence for Pictish matrilineal succession. The victim of these unhelpful slips will inevitably be the hapless student or general reader who comes to this book looking for a sound introduction to the subject.

Anyone coming to the subject for the first time will probably be unaware of the book's inaccuracies, but they are bound to notice occasions where material is presented in a confused fashion. We are told, for instance, that "Pictland was believed to be divided into seven regions (or kingdoms)...Fortriu extended through Strathearn and Mentieth (sic). Fib (Fife) is usually coupled with Fortriu, and collectively they comprised modern Fife and Kinross." (p. 58) Anyone who does not know Scotland would be forgiven for thinking that Fife and Kinross must include Strathearn and Menteith. Anyone who does know Scotland will be utterly confused. In any event, Fib (Fife) is never coupled with Fortriu. Fothriff, however, is habitually coupled with Fife (in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, at least), and "Fife and Fothriff" do correspond more-or-less to the (pre-1975) counties of Fife and Kinross. Alas, it appears that the Laings have got Fortriu and Fothriff mixed up.

If the reader gives up on the seven Pictish regions, he is confronted by another conundrum when he turns the page. Figure 39 (p. 60) is taken up with drawings of what the caption calls 'Representations of warriors on Pictish stones'. The last of these warriors is brandishing not an axe, or the spear or sword which we are told on the opposite page were the "main weapons of the Pictish warrior" (p. 61), but a jawbone. The reader is given no assistance in making sense of this, and might reasonably suspect that key aspects of Pictish military technology had remained unchanged since the Stone Age. The picture, however, is not a representation of a Pictish warrior at all, but is a portrayal of the Biblical David wielding the jawbone of an ass.
Writing a book for readers new to a subject as complicated as the Picts and the Dál Riata is always going to be a challenge. It is a very different world from our own, and will tax the most articulate and analytical author in bringing it accurately to life. It would be wrong to say that the Laings have completely failed to do this in *The Picts and the Scots*. What is most regrettable, however, is that this book has too many avoidable errors and confusions to make it recommendable for the student, or general reader, for whom it is intended.

**DAUVIT BROUN**

**UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW**


In October of 1993 HISTORIC SCOTLAND issued the first two titles in a new series of books focusing upon Scotland’s ancient monuments and historic sites. The series is aimed at a wide audience: tourists, enthusiasts, academics and anyone else with a passion for Scotland’s past. What better topic to begin such a series with than those romanticized ruffians from the north, the Vikings. In *Viking Scotland*, Anna Ritchie provides a colourful examination of Scandinavian Scotland as seen through the archaeological record.

The book begins by outlining some of the main views of the Vikings - from bloodthirsty marauders to settled farmers and fishermen. Ritchie argues that there were several stages to the Norse conquest and colonization of the Scottish Isles, a fact which is made more clear when the growing body of archaeological evidence is examined in conjunction with the often meagre written record. This fact, is especially important if we are going to properly understand the relationship between the incoming Norse and the native inhabitants of the Northern and Western Isles, where the Vikings had the greatest impact. Developing this idea, the author begins by examining the archaeological record left by the Picts and Scots. It is argued that when the archaeological record for these indigenous groups is taken in conjunction with that of the incoming Norse, it is possible to
establish a certain degree of coexistence or cultural borrowing between the various groups. At least part of this borrowing process stems from the Vikings' recognition of the strengths of native society and adaptation to a similar way of life.

Chapter three of the book is essentially designed to provide a background for the following three chapters. It begins with a brief review of the sources for Viking Scotland - sagas, place names, archaeology - and the problems associated with each. From here the discussion moves into a general description of Viking society as seen through the archaeological record. The following three chapters provide a more in-depth look at what has been found, and what can be seen which makes Scotland such an interesting and important region for the study of the Viking achievement. This portion of the work is comprised of a catalogue of the main archaeological sites, beginning with the Northern Isles and Caithness, Argyll and the Western Isles, and finishes off with a brief look at the scant evidence in southern and eastern Scotland. The final two chapters, 'After the Vikings: Late Norse Scotland AD. 1100 - 1300,' and 'Scotland's Viking Inheritance, logically focus upon the Orkneys and Shetland, where a Norse presence was maintained the longest. These final chapters are of a very cursory nature and leave the reader somewhat wanting. Admittedly, this is in large part due to the emphasis upon the archaeological record which after A.D. 1100 tends to take a backseat to the written sources which increasingly become more reliable.

For anyone looking for new insights or interpretations of the Viking experience in Scotland the book may come as a bit of a disappointment. However, this was not the purpose of the work. The book instead is designed to provide the reader with an informative introduction to the archaeology of Viking Age Scotland. In this respect Viking Age Scotland is highly successful. The work is heavily illustrated with both colour and black and white plates, contains many good maps, and is organized in a very readable fashion. More importantly, the author has brought together a substantial body of archaeological information; material which the amateur enthusiast often finds difficult to locate and comprehend. Dr. Ritchie has provided an excellent begin-
ning to what should prove to be a most interesting and informative series from HISTORIC SCOTLAND.

Scott A McLean
University of Guelph


The Ruthwell Cross, one of the most glorious relics of Anglo-Saxon culture, exhibits an extensive program of sculpture, the longest extant series of Anglo-Latin inscriptions, the longest Old English runic inscription, and the most beautiful poem in the Old Northumbrian dialect. (p71) A victim of zealous Covenanting iconoclasts in 1642, some of the cross's pieces were rediscovered in 1771. The monument was reconstructed by the Rev Henry Duncan in 1802, and in 1887, it was reinstalled inside the parish church at Ruthwell, close by the Solway Firth in Dumfriesshire. There it still stands in an awkward setting which nonetheless cannot detract from the majesty of the sculpture.

This volume is the first of a series of Occasional Papers from The Index of Christian Art at Princeton University, appropriately devoted to what the editor describes as 'the most important sculptural survival from Anglo-Saxon Britain and arguably from early medieval Europe.' (p3) Four scholars contributed to a conference at Princeton in 1989 and they now (together with Brendan Cassidy Director of The Index) publish their papers in this magnificent volume. Until now the only published guide available to the visitor has been old J.L. Dinwiddie's much reprinted, The Ruthwell Cross and Its Story which first appeared in 1927. There is no comparison between the two publications. Dinwiddie's booklet is anecdotal, filopietistic and inaccurate. Cassidy's collection represents the best of modern scholarship presented in generally accessible form with numerous excellent illustrations and an extensive bibliography. It is to be hoped that, reasonably priced as it is, the book will be available locally to interested purchasers.
To the non-specialist (such as your reviewer) some of the contributions will appear as impenetrable as the iconography of the cross itself yet it is comforting to note that the wide range of specialism and expertise required to investigate the monument long since exceeded the competence of any one individual. Bob Farrell’s piece on the construction, deconstruction and reconstruction of the cross is hard-going but essential. Equally David Howlett’s ‘Inscriptions and Design of The Ruthwell Cross’ is a meticulous reconstruction of the Latin and Runic inscriptions, beautifully complemented by Paul Meyvaert’s lengthy and immensely learned ‘A New Perspective on The Ruthwell Cross: Ecclesia and Vita Monastica’, which must rank as one of the most innovative, and suggestive, discussions on the subject ever published. Fortunately, each author intelligently and intelligibly summarises his conclusions.

One of the heroes of the Ruthwell saga was Henry Duncan who resurrected the cross in the manse garden in 1802, later commissioning a cross-shaft decorated with masonic insignia to replace the missing original. Best known as the founder of the Savings Bank Movement in 1810 he was also a poor law reformer, one of the founders of the Free Church in 1843 and a published novelist. As a young man he erected a brick and mortar mausoleum for his pet nightingale. Water flowed through the eye sockets of a grieving human face carved on the structure. (p99) The early experiment in monumentation prepared him for the Ruthwell reconstruction which reversed the main panels on either side of the cross while the masonic emblemeage was possibly designed to overcome the ‘papistical’ associations of the sculpture (p17), though Dr. Cassidy (p17) should perhaps have noted that Duncan was a well known Catholic emancipist.

Cassidy’s contribution on the documented history of the cross—since 1600— is fascinating, charting, as it does, forgotten battles between English commentators and Scandinavian scholars, between British xenophobes and European experts. Most dis-agreements occurred over the runic inscriptions about which, for long, an inability to read, did not preclude a propensity to write. The iconography did not attract much attention until the 1940s. One hundred years earlier the Anglo-Saxonist John Mitchell Kemble recognised that the runes preserved part of the
remarkable poem 'The Dream of the Rood' in the early Northumbrian dialect. The inscription personifies the Ruthwell Cross as the cross or 'rood' of the crucifixion - the cross on the cross - which suffers along with its victim who, however, is no passive sacrifice but a heroic young Anglo-Saxon warrior embracing death:

I. God Almighty stripped Himself. When He wished to ascend on to the gallows, brave before all men, I dared not bow down, but had to stand fast.
II. I raised up a powerful King. I dared not tilt the Lord of Heaven. Men mocked us both together. I was drenched with blood issued from the Man's side after He sent forth His spirit.
III. Christ was on the Cross. But hastening nobles came together there from afar. I beheld it all. Sorely was I with sorrows afflicted. I bent to men, to their hands.
IV. Wounded with arrows they laid Him down weary in limb. They stood for him at the head of His corpse. They beheld their Heaven's Lord. And He rested Himself there for a time. (p88)

As Brendan Cassidy points out, to English participants in the acrimonious dispute about the cross's origins it had 'become more than just a fascinating artifact. It was a national symbol, a testament to native genius...' (p28) No doubt that was so but, asks Douglas Mac Lean, as many of us have asked, - 'what is the greatest Anglo-Saxon cross doing in the middle of a British Celtic Kingdom?' (p49), in his excellent contribution on 'The Date of the Ruthwell Cross'. Rosemary Cramp, the great authority on Northumbrian Sculpture whose presence haunts many of the pages in this volume, suggested two dates for the cross one c684 the other around 750. Mac Lean effectively demolishes the earlier date on the grounds that the British or Brittonic, Kingdom of Rheged, in which Ruthwell stood, was not effectively controlled by the Northumbrians until later. Bede completed his great Historia in 731. At that time the number of believers at Whithorn, west along the Solway Coast, had 'so increased' that a new bishopric was necessary. The bishop appointed was Pechelm who died in 735; and Mac Lean, Howlett and Meyvaert
appear to concur that a date between 731 and 735 appears most likely for the erection of the cross at Ruthwell.

Paul Meyvaert proposes a new alignment for the panels on the cross. Since Ruthwell is much less weathered than its sibling at Bewcastle he assumes, on the analogy of the great monastery at St Gall, that the cross was originally housed in the church, or monastery, at Ruthwell 'part way up the nave' of the church one side facing the people of the congregation, the other, with its more obscure iconography, facing the monks. There is some evidence for an early Christian structure (probably Celtic in origin) at Ruthwell but Meyvaert's case, brilliantly argued though it is, must remain not proven, though his complex arguments will fully repay close study.

This is a wonderful book full of insights, suggestions and novel interpretations. It may not be Christian to ask for more. However the dating of the runes and explanations of how they came to be affixed to the cross seem to me inadequate; perhaps they always will be. There is no mention (that I can find) of whether the cross was painted or decorated - presumably it was? Paul Meyvaert seems disinclined to detect any propaganda value in the artifact. Yet he himself emphasises the Apocalyptic iconography on the monument and he tends to see some of the ideas fossilised by the carver or carvers as drawing inspiration from Bede's Commentaries, or at least, the Bede circle. Bede was more than a little interested in Apocalyptic matters and indeed Robert Hanning argued some years ago that his History was designed to show how God had chosen the English people for the divine task of converting the Britons to Roman Christianity. In that battle the Britons ultimately lost out, but in their defeat there was an apocalyptic element - salvation in the form of theAngles. Ruthwell may indeed have been closer to the coast in the 8th century than it is now (p35) yet why is it there at all? Surely not because it is at the end of Hadrian's wall (p35); the ecclesiastical foundation should have been in the vicinity of Gretna if historical geography was the issue. Possibly the site was chosen for ease of navigation in the treacherous waters of the Solway. The position of Ruthwell looks as if it were on a route from Ireland to Lindisfarne or the Celtic monasteries in Eastern Scotland following tracks to the north, rather than to the south,
of the Cheviots. However that may be, the Northumbrians clearly controlled the hinterland of Ruthwell long before they did that of Whithorn. Could there be a commemorative, even a propagandist element in raising this spectacular cross to celebrate the Northumbrian penetration to the west coast? Did someone stand at Ruthwell, as we still can today and see the Solway framed as it is by the Lakeland mountains on one side and the Galloway hills on the other, the sea road to Ireland, home of the enemy both ethnic and religious?

Speculation is easy and speculation about the Ruthwell Cross will continue. One thing is certain - with the publication of this volume a visit to Ruthwell Kirk will never be the same again.

EDWARD J. COWAN
UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW


From where I stand, the archaeology of the Dark Ages in North Britain and Ireland are still fairly murky, notwithstanding recent exciting developments in the settlement archaeology of the Picts. We do, of course, have a wonderful heritage of the artistic, technological and craft expression of those peoples represented in their manuscripts, jewellery and sculpted stones. It is this material which is examined in this vast volume of 32 papers presented at the Second International Conference on Insular Art at Edinburgh in 1991. This is an important reference work which should be dipped into rather than read from cover to cover as this author had to! It forms a marvellous complement to the "Work of Angels" exhibition which was on in Edinburgh at the same time as the Conference. Indeed, this volume should be used in tandem with the exhibition catalogue produced in 1989 by Susan Youngs and published by the British Museum.

This book demonstrates the fruitful exchange which existed within the insular world of Britain and Ireland and between
them and the continent. The quality, content, range and volume of papers suggest that scholarship within this subject is alive and kicking. The subject may be better known to some readers as “Hiberno-Saxon” and deals with “the migration of artistic ideas through time and space”. The volume is marvelously illustrated, particularly by some new photographs especially commissioned from Tom Gray.

The volume is divided up into 5 sections, the first one being entitled “Migration of Ideas”. A particularly useful paper in this was by the late Robert Stephenson entitled “Further Thoughts”, which includes some useful comments on the influence and development of motives in Pictish art. He casts his net wide for useful comparative sources, not always suggesting direct influences but rather providing helpful interpretation. He makes some particularly interesting comments on the influence of Byzantine mosaic on the exotic figures sculpture of the St Andrews tomb shrine. He reminds us that Pictish monasteries and their libraries, now long lost to us, had a significant influence on the art of the time.

Part 2 is entitled “Centres of Patronage and Production”. One highlight of this section was the paper by Ewan Campbell and Alan Lane, who used the metal-working evidence from Dunadd to discuss Celtic and Germanic interaction in Dalriada. Here they argue for the presence of exiled aristocratic Northumbrians at this chief place. They highlight the regular contact which existed between Iona and Northumbria.

Part 3, entitled “Insular Manuscripts”, includes a paper by Jacques Guilmain, which goes into some considerable detail on examination of ornamentation of illuminated manuscripts. This includes 8 pages of explanatory diagrams showing how interlace patterns were designed, planned and executed.

Part 4 on “Insular Metalwork”, includes an important paper by James Graham-Campbell on the Norries Law Hoard, which is of particular interest to me as the Regional Archaeologist for Fife where this hoard was found - this is an extremely good story as well as a good piece of scholarship. The hoard was found around 1819 and contained a massive 12.5 kg of silver, sadly most of which was melted down. The hoard contained some late Roman
treasure, as well as Pictish material which could have been deposited as early as the Northumbrian invasion of Fife in 655. Margaret Nieke's paper on brooches quotes the Ancient Laws of Ireland to help understand how the rank of nobility could be displayed by the particular type of brooch being worn. This paper reinforces the opinion that Kings would have controlled their availability by having metal-workers' workshops within their Royal settlements. This paper discusses the "amuletic" powers of brooches, offering protection from evil. She discusses the fascinating idea that some meaningful details were purposefully designed in such a way to be accessible only to the wearer.

Again, with my personal interest in Fife, I would highlight the paper by Graham Ritchie and Jack Stevenson in part 5, "Insular Sculpture". This deals with the Pictish cave art at the Wemyss Caves and the re-survey carried out in 1984 by the Royal Commission. The fascinating story is told of the history of discovery and recording from the 19th century up to the present day. They discuss the probability that the carving of the vessel is indeed Pictish, although this was not spotted or recorded under strange circumstances until 1906. This work has been superceded by a paper (not published here) by LeBon, which argues for the boat being a fake. The carvings in the Wemyss Caves are discussed in the context of other Fife symbols on Pictish stones, and the authors discuss the links with specific symbols on the Norries Law plaques and a now lost carving from Doo Cave. The interesting suggestion is made that "the motifs found on the walls of the caves result from temporary or seasonal encampment of metal-workers in silver ....."

Another highlight of this section is Professor Leslie Alcock's paper on "Image and Icon in Pictish Sculpture". He bravely takes the (Burghead) bull by the horns in questioning whether the naturalistic class 1 animal engravings have some iconic or symbolic meaning. He answers this in the affirmative due to their juxtaposition with meaningful abstract symbols. He goes on to discuss the royal hunting scene on the Hilton of Cadboll stone, and the royal sport of falconry, displayed on a stone now at Elgin. He also comments on the implications for royal patronage of sculptors - reminding the subjects who viewed the stone of the King's wealth and power. He explores Christian iconography of
hunting schemes, for instance, Christ being represented as a deer, thus equalling the victim or the persecuted one. He explores the idea that this may have been one actual historical hunt which is recorded, just as the Aberlemno battle stone depicts one specific battle, that is Nechtansmere.

In conclusion, this corpus is an important contribution to the scholarship of this material which, when properly studied, provides great insights into the lives of the people of this period; their personal expression, skills and beliefs. One criticism, however, is that although the 5 sections are enumerated on the contents page, there is no break in the text from paper to paper, and thus you are unaware when passing between the helpfully grouped themes. Other than this, Spearman and Higgitt have done a remarkable job in gathering together these papers and publishing them rapidly. We can look forward to another volume in the near future as the 3rd Conference on Insular Art is to be held in Belfast in 1994.

PETER A YEOMAN
REGIONAL ARCHAEOLOGIST, FIFE.


In his seminal The Making of Modern Ireland 1603-1923 (1965), J.C. Beckett reminded students of Irish history that the outbreak of the Irish Rebellion in the autumn of 1641 was incomprehensible, unless it was seen as one facet of a wider British crisis, and a leading cause of a much larger conflict, which he termed 'The War of the Three Kingdoms.' A decade later J.G.A. Pocock issued his famous plea for a new subject, to be known as 'British History,' in the pages of The Journal of Modern History. Since these early calls to examine the history of what Pocock called the 'Atlantic Archipelago,' and its peoples, in the widest possible context, many works have appeared which have sought to explore British history through comparisons and contrasts among its many parts. It is now
possible to cite numerous historians who have written ‘British history,’ rather than simply offering English history writ large.

It is arguable that the seventeenth century, and particularly the general crisis which led to armed conflict in all three kingdoms of Britain, and the eventual downfall of Charles I, is a period which lends itself especially well to the exploration of regional factors, and the weight which they gave to the general crisis. In this spirit Conrad Russell’s *The Fall of the British Monarchies*, and the collection of essays edited by John Morrill in *The Scottish National Covenant in its British Context*, succeed admirably in challenging readers to look to the wider British implications of crown policies, and the responses they received in the years leading up to the War of the Three Kingdoms. The general reader will find many trenchant discussions of diverse topics from the role of mercenary service on the continent in the making of the Covenanting Army (Edward Furgol, ‘Scotland turned Sweden: The Scottish Covenanters and the Military Revolution, 1638-1651‘ in *The Scottish National Covenant* pp. 134-154), to Russell’s compelling speculations surrounding the blinkered religious obsessions of Charles I and John Pym, which the author argues made a resolution of the British crisis nearly impossible to achieve. For an instructor looking to offer a senior undergraduate or graduate seminar on the period, these two volumes together provide excellent potential topics for debate, discussion, and presentations. Only the present cost of the two hard cover volumes pose problems in selecting them as specialized texts.

As individual works, clearly Russell’s is the volume which offers the greatest unity in terms of narrative and information, as this is obviously easier to achieve in a single study, than in a collection of monographs. At the same time however, *The Fall of the British Monarchies* is in many ways a companion volume to Russell’s 1990 release, *The Causes of the English Civil War* (Clarendon Press), which offer the texts of his 1987-88 Ford Lectures at Oxford. As Russell notes in the introduction to *Fall*, the essays contained in *Causes*, are essentially intended to serve as expansions on the Introduction and Conclusions contained in the larger volume. What is missing from *The Fall of the British Monarchies*, is the detailed attention he had given to the evolution of the
Church of England from the reign of Elizabeth, and his assessment of the effects of the union of the crowns in 1603, and the subsequent challenge of ruling the Multiple Kingdom. Nonetheless, *Fall* provides enough background and context to make the density of his subject sufficiently accessible.

In the main, *The Fall of the British Monarchies* is a highly detailed account of events stretching from the revolt against the Scottish Prayer book in 1637, through the Bishops Wars, the summoning of the Short and Long Parliaments, the outbreak of the Irish Rebellion, to the eventual formation of Royalist and Parliamentary parties and the drift into the English Civil War. Those looking for discussions of local factors, economic causes and evidence of long-term erosion in the English political system will find that Dr. Russell has not changed his views. Insofar as he is concerned with explaining why Charles I raised his standard at Nottingham in August of 1642, Russell’s line of reasoning will be very familiar to those who have read his earlier works.

What is fresh and challenging, however, especially for students of Scottish history, is the degree to which Scottish events, and particularly the efforts of the Scottish commissioners in London, are seen as central to the divide which existed and widened between Charles, and many members of the parliamentary opposition. At the same time, Russell is quick to point out that for many English parliamentarians, dallying with the Scots after the Treaty of Berwick constituted an alliance of convenience, rather than a universal desire to remake the Church of England in a Presbyterian image. Thus, the influence of the Scottish commissioners on debates surrounding such things as the ‘Root and Branch’ Petition, are instructive of the lack of consensus which existed in the early months of the Long Parliament.

The central premise of the essays collected by Morrill is that for too long, the impact of the Scottish National Covenant has been underestimated by historians of England and seen only as of major importance to Scotland by historians of that nation. In *The Scottish National Covenant in its British Context*, Morrill et al. make a compelling case for the Covenant’s centrality to the wider British crisis of the late 1630s and 40s, as well as demonstrating that the Covenanters themselves were reacting in British
terns (through pushing the adoption of Presbyterianism for the other two kingdoms as the only means for its survival in Scotland) to the inherently British adjustments which Charles I attempted among his three churches.

If Russell had argued for England that long-term causes for the Civil War are largely unsustainable, Morrill's contributors make an equally compelling case for long-term explanations for the Covenant and Scottish discontent. In their essays, Margaret Steele and Edward Cowan indicate that there were numerous political, cultural, and especially theological antecedents which fostered a covenanting tradition in Scotland, and quite clearly the National Covenant itself.

A related issue is the degree to which the Covenanters represented universal, or authentic Scottish opinion after 1637. In his essay on the Scottish Royalist nobility, Keith Brown argues that courtiers such as the Dukes of Hamilton and Lennox had become part of a wider family of British nobility in the decades following the union of the crowns, but that this should not be seen as a disqualification for their potential utility to the king as advisors on Scottish affairs, particularly as they had largely succeeded in keeping their networks alive in their home kingdom. As so often happened with Charles I, however, he failed to recognize good advice when it was given. It is a pity that in offering this qualifier to the traditional "Scots versus the king" account of the rise of the Covenanters, that an essay could not have been provided dealing with Scottish Episcopalianism. If Brown is correct in asserting that marriage ties, and shared interests at court were helping to create a 'British' nobility then perhaps some light could have been shed on figures such as Bishops Maxwell and Wedderburn, who were the most enthusiastic supporters of the revised Scottish Canons and Prayer Book. Indeed, Robert Baillie himself expressed concerns at the Glasgow Assembly of 1638, over the participants' venom concerning "matters indifferent," indicating some internal division among the covenanters themselves, where the key issue of church discipline since the five Articles of Perth, was concerned.

_The Scottish National Covenant_, rounds off the 'British' emphasis of the essays with a welcomed piece from Michael Perceval-Maxwell, on the effects of the Covenant in Ireland, particularly
in Ulster. While obvious religious and cultural affinities existed between Scotland, and the plantation colonies in Ulster, one of Perceval-Maxwell’s most telling observations surrounds the Ulster Scots’ desire to embrace the Covenant as a defence against the local Catholic community. Again, this points to the subtleties involved in assessing the wider British dimensions of any event in the period. For further elucidation on these themes, readers can look forward to Professor Perceval-Maxwell’s *Outbreak of the Irish Rebellion*, which is due shortly.

In conclusion then, both Russell, and the historians marshaled by Morrill, succeed in widening the vision of students of mid-seventeenth century Britain. While no review can do such involved subjects much justice, the fact remains that works such as these are ultimately further steps toward the study of history in comparative, regional and cultural terms. For a subject as studied as the decline and fall of Charles I, these volumes provide much needed fresh insights, as they succeed in tearing away national blinkers and preoccupations.

Andrew D. Nicholls
University of Guelph


The seventeenth century remains one of the most turbulent periods of Scottish history. It was a time of violent controversy over political, religious and social issues, all of which became intimately intertwined. Eyewitness accounts of this period, such as James Kirkton’s manuscript — best known as *The Secret and True History of the Church of Scotland from 1660 to 1678* — give us valuable insights into the passions and ideas of these times. For producing a new edition of Kirkton’s work, Ralph Stewart is to be commended. There are, unfortunately, some problems which might have easily been avoided.

One of Stewart’s intents was to avoid the extensive notes of the earlier edition produced by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe in 1817, notes which undermined Kirkton’s observations by, in
Stewart's words, "contradicting them and making counter accusations." (p. v). In this edition, Stewart has erred on the side of caution. He simply has not provided enough information so that the reader can place Kirkton's observations into some kind of critical context. This need not have been done throughout the text. It could, however, have been done well and succinctly in the introduction. Stewart's discussion of the literary place of Kirkton's work is quite well done. It is therefore unfortunate that he chose to devote less than a page to a terse outline of the historical events of the period. The major historical works on this period, for example Rosalind Mitchison's volume in the New History of Scotland Lordship to Patronage: Scotland 1603-1745 or the writings of David Stevenson, are also strangely absent from the Bibliography.

Given the complexity of the period and the strong feelings that it continues to engender this is a serious mistake. For example, within his History Kirkton has this to say, in part, about the period from 1649-1650:

...these two years, in my opinion, were the best two years that Scotland ever saw.

...Every minister was to be tried five times a year, both for his personal and ministerial behaviour; every congregation was to be visited by the presbyterie, that they might see how the vine flourished, and how the pomegranate budded. And there was no case nor question in the meanest family in Scotland, but it might become the object of the deliberation of the General Assembly,... as the bands of the Scottish church were strong, so her beauty was bright, no error was so much as named, the people were not only sound in faith, but innocently ignorant of unsound doctrine; no scandalous person could live, no scandal could be concealed in all Scotland, so strict a correspondence there was betwixt ministers and congregations. (p.22-23)

A "golden age of the Covenanters"? (p. i) Certainly not for everyone in Scotland. Certainly not for those women executed as witches during the major witch-hunt that erupted. Certainly not even for all "Covenanters" - for the movement had irrepara-
bly split by this period, a fact that Stewart nowhere makes clear. Kirkton has strong opinions about church and nation. They may have been countered by equally strong opinions by his contemporaries, as Stewart describes (p. iii-iv). However, some kind of objective outline of the period is necessary in order for the reader to form his or her own opinions. I would contest Stewart's opinion that Kirkton's book was "a kind of refutation by demonstration, by being clear-minded, sensible, and balanced" (p. iv). Kirkton's is a very opinionated, at times polemical history. The balance to that needed to come from the editor in the introduction.

Stewart's edition also suffers because of its poor index. Picky? Perhaps. Yet, as Stewart notes in his introduction, Kirkton has been—unfairly—criticized as "an astonishing source book for demonology." (p. vii) Why then did Stewart not demonstrate the unfairness of this caricaturization by noting the very few times when witchcraft is mentioned in the text via the index? Topical indicators such as "Covenant," "The Engagement," "Conventicles" would also have been helpful for the browser who wants to see what Kirkton has to say about these and other particular events.

In the end, it will be up to each reader to decide whether or not they agree with Kirkton's analysis of the events of the turbulent seventeenth century. It is fascinating to read his portrayal of Montrose's army (20), or of the corruption of non-presbyterian clergy: "Of drunkenness I need not accuse them; no man will deny they wallow in our gutters drunk in their canonical gowns." (104) However, in order to be able to place such comments into a context, one needs to have a good historical survey such as Mitchison's always close at hand.

STUART MACDONALD
BALTIMORE, ONTARIO

As the twentieth century draws to a close, and the restructuring of Europe continues apace, historian Linda Colley challenges us to shed our notion that great nations are necessarily constant, or culturally uniform. She argues that, in the period 1707-1837, a British identity developed from and co-existed with the more traditional national identities of English, Welsh, Scottish, and Irish. The construction and presentation of this 'new' identity renders an intriguing and entertaining picture of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

In conceptual terms, Britons is a large, exploratory, and reflective work that blends synthesis with innovation. It is her contention that Protestantism was the fundamental feature of Britishness that reinforced perception of themselves as a chosen people, as "another and a better Israel" (p. 30). Identification also occurred in terms of what they emphatically were not: Catholic (with the negative associations of French support of the exiled Stuarts, famine, and oppressive monarchical and papal power over the lives of such people). This practice of defining oneself relative to the Other, to use Colley's term, should be recognisable to Canadians and their proximity to the United States.

While the discussion of Protestantism is quite Anglocentric, attention to economic and imperial developments embodies more of the 'Britishness' that the reader is expecting. It is in these themes of the larger thesis that she addresses the contributions of the Scots in particular and showcases "the self-made man of trade as [a] hero" within Britain (p. 58). In matters of extending trade, advancing larger British interests, and fighting for the causes of Great Britain, Scots rose to prominence and a certain measure of status: they brought tea from the East and furs from the West, represented non-Scottish constituencies, soldiered in the American colonies, and governed in Bengal. These things were done to benefit themselves as well as the larger polity. Colley is certainly correct to emphasize that "[f]or
some Scots...empire became a profession in itself, an opportunity for power, responsibilities and excitement on a scale they could never have enjoyed back home.” (p. 127)

Following the loss of the American colonies in 1783 (Britain's only war-related defeat during this period), Colley argues convincingly that the governing elite faced a crisis of legitimacy. From this watershed "Britain's ruling class...increase[d] in size, in homogeneity, in wealth and in range of power", (p. 149) while re-asserting that its authority accorded with the interests of all British citizens. In part this was done through re-packaging and 'marketing' the Royal Family and the trappings of Majesty to appeal to non-elites. This section of her argument is an extended consideration of how antiquity and domesticity could be elevated and exalted as complementary features of the Hanoverian dynasty in the person of George III who was "ultimately [a] mediocre man" (p. 229).

The contributions of ordinary women and men, Colley maintains, were necessary to the development of patriotism and British identity. The French example was again held up for criticism. By showing "the unnaturalness of female participation in the public sphere" (p. 245) it was possible to emphasize that domesticity and the private sphere were adequate for British women generally because adhered to by Charlotte, Queen Consort to George III. Women's role lay in fostering familial pride as part of a civic virtue that enhanced the well-being of the state. If the doctrine of separate spheres was, as Colley asserts, both a political concept and a moral contract (p. 263), then women influenced men to work for their benefit. When addressing the common soldier or the unenfranchised male to take part in the militia-based 'defense' of Britain (and not merely his county or parish of residence), calculated appeals to a variety of motivations were necessary and ranged from self-interest and coercion, to economic pressures and out-and-out patriotism.

The final theme considered by Colley is how Britain coped with peace in 1815 following decades of war-centred crisis management. After defining themselves in relation to their French enemy for so long, how would the created British identity be sustained? Part of the answer lay in 'reaching out' to include
the peripheral and the marginalized: parliamentary union with Ireland in 1800, franchise and borough reform (which was felt particularly in Wales, Scotland, and the industrializing regions of England), and the assumption of greater responsibility for citizens of the acquired empire.

While the argument presented by Colley is, for the most part, handled capably, there are aspects which generate speculation. Other than the financial misfortunes of the Royal African Company, the relationship between imperial trade and the nation state was symbiotic more than it was parasitic. Scots, for example, played prominent roles in both the East India and Hudson’s Bay Companies, neither of which proved draining on Britain’s financial or human resources. Further, what impact did non-English commercial activities have on national as well as regional economic markets? Or would it be ‘profitable’ to consider in more detail the education of Britons at Scottish schools and universities? The assessment of people-power is strongly Anglocentric, necessitating a particularly concerted search for the Welsh in the development of this British identity. Did Wales effectively remain ‘foreign’, beset with intense localism rather than a sense of belonging to a larger group? Questions such as these remain to be addressed.

Professor Colley has dared to ask difficult questions of both her sources and how we have understood this period to date. The final product is broadly-based (including state papers, contemporary magazines and correspondence, sermon literature, memoirs, and a variety of interpretive works), and effectively illustrated (utilizing engravings, plaster work, portraits, maps, propaganda prints, and even playing cards). Price will most likely keep this book out of the hands of many readers, general and specialist alike, who would otherwise enjoy such a provocative and engagingly written book.

Donna Beaudin
University of Guelph

100

Professor Speck’s new book is designed as an overview of British history during the period of the undisputed sovereignty of the United Kingdom, ie. from the Union of 1707 to Britain’s entry to the EEC and the referendum on that issue in 1975. His overall theme is one of evolutionary rather than revolutionary change, accounted for by the ability of the oligarchy of each era to accept change “by persuasion rather than by force”. He attributes this success also to the extraordinary ability of the British state to “deliver the goods”, to create a remarkably consistent degree of prosperity for much of the period under consideration. By necessity, such a general work can dwell little on any one event, but Speck’s work is remarkably complete given the limitations of space.

The book’s organization reflects this all-embracing quality, in which social history is not sacrificed to the expediency of political history. Each of the three centuries is introduced with a chapter on major social, cultural and political trends of the time, followed by specific chapters concerned primarily with politics. This works quite effectively, although the political analysis at times seems to take place quite separately from the wider issues discussed in the introductory chapters. Scotland receives little separate treatment apart from considerable attention to the negotiations over the Union and occasional references to its voting patterns in later centuries, as well as the growth of the Scottish nationalist movement in the 1970’s.

The book works very effectively as an introduction to modern British history, as it manages to be both comprehensive and yet does not sacrifice context or give short shrift to more important social and political shifts. Speck perhaps by necessity interprets his parameters literally; there is very little attention to Ireland, foreign affairs or the empire, except as they influenced domestic policy. He concludes with the conjecture that as “most Scots came to accept that they were better off as North Britons... membership of the EC (may) be resolved in much the same way”. This book is an excellent introduction to modern British history.

David R. Devereux
St. John Fisher College

101
very student of modern Scottish social history owes a
tremendous debt to Christopher Smout's pioneeri-
ing scholarship. His prodigious output has shaped
the examination of the subject and his *History of the
Scottish People*, first published in 1969, is still the starting point for
anyone, professional and general reader alike, seeking to gain
an understanding of the social forces which have shaped Scot-
land since the Reformation. Professor Smout has consistently
endeavoured to present his insights to the widest possible
audience through a prose style that makes comprehensible even
obscure subjects. Those of us lucky enough to have studied
under him know full well the commitment and missionary zeal
that he brought to his work. Although Professor Smout has now
retired from the Chair of Scottish History at St. Andrews, he
remains a very active researcher in his capacity as head of a new
Environmental History unit.

This *festschrift* is largely the work of individuals who, in a
variety of capacities, have been Professor Smout's colleagues at
St. Andrews. Former students of the University, such as myself,
will find in Roger Mason's appreciation a pleasantly familiar
figure. Unfortunately this profile and the accompanying list of
publications, already out of date, are the only sections of the
volume that deal directly with Professor Smout's impact on the
study of Scottish History.

That is not to suggest that the contributions are not compe-
tent: quite the contrary. There are a number of provocative,
stimulating articles, particularly Chris Whatley's fulsome exami-
nation of two centuries of Royal Birthday riots, Jane Dawson's
intriguing analysis of the link between the growth of Campbell
power and the evolution of the Highland road network and
Roger Mason's convincing analysis of the contribution of renaiss-
sance chivalry to the Scottish identity. These articles touch on
themes - popular protest, Highland development and the emer-
gence of Scottish nationalism - to which Christopher Smout has
been instrumental in drawing attention. But only Mason's arti-
cle refers directly to Smout's contribution to the debate, using
his "concentric loyalties" model of eighteenth-century nationalism as a point of departure. Dawson's analysis of Highland development, with her emphasis on political and religious factors, departs from Smout's emphasis on broad economic considerations, but this is not made clear. Whatley's endnotes demonstrate the debt owed to Smout, but again this is not acknowledged in the text of his article. Although this does not detract from his argument, that the Birthday Riot represented an enshrinement and ritualization of popular culture into an acceptable context for Lowland Scotland.

The absence of an index makes it difficult to be certain, but this reviewer could find only one other direct reference to Smout's scholarship in the text. William Knox initiates his examination of late Victorian working-class politics with reference to Smout's concept of a Scottish "radical political tradition" and then demonstrates how Gladstonian liberalism accommodated this tradition. Although Keith Brown's examination of the early seventeenth-century Jean Livingston murder trial, David Stevenson's exploration of elite manners under Charles I and C.J.A. Robertson's discussion of Highland Railway Mania all touch on areas examined by Smout, surprisingly he does not rate an endnote in their contributions. Curiously, Colin Martin's article, a fascinating study from the world of Scottish marine archaeology and as such the farthest removed from Professor Smout's own published work, contains the clearest acknowledgement to the inspiration of his colleague.

In fairness, essays offered in honour of a colleague are often regarded by the authors as a gift of some of their best work, which may indeed have little connection with the recipient's own interests. Certainly Stephen Boardman's and Norman Macdougall's explorations into late medieval Scottish political history would fall into this category. It is also true that a general failing of all festschriften is a lack of continuity and clarity. Nevertheless, the majority of these articles reflect Smout's own scholarship, as does the volume's title. A carefully crafted introduction, linking the various contributions to Smout's legacy, is sorely needed in order for this collection to live up to the expectations it raises. On their own, each of these articles represents an important contribution to Scottish historical schol-
arship, but taken together they fall short of the breadth of vision so evident in Professor Smout’s own work. This is a book for specialists, who will probably only consult the articles which deal with their own research interests. With these considerations in mind, along with the prohibitive cost, general readers who are interested in learning more about “People and Power” in Scotland are better advised to invest in copies of Smout’s own History of the Scottish People and A Century of Scottish People, which are both available in Canada in the relatively inexpensive paperback format.

MICHAEL E. VANCE
SAINT MARY’S UNIVERSITY


Grampian, by Jim Henderson, and The Highlands, by David Paterson, are two primarily pictorial books in a series called Photographers’ Britain. In his introduction to Grampian, Mr. Henderson states that he would like to accomplish several things in the course of the book: project his love for the Grampian region of Scotland into his photographs, capture the region in a limited number of images, show details, and explore the intersection of ancient structures and places with modern life.

Although the photographs form the nucleus of the book, the accompanying narrative on the facing pages is often personalized and makes you not only look longer at the photo, but also causes you to imagine what lies just outside of the lens. The stories may point out local lore, address other picturesque points of interest, or draw your attention toward some exquisite detail of the photograph you might otherwise have missed.

Beautiful attention to detail can be seen in The Burn of Tilbouries, Maryculter (p. vi), with the moss covered rocks in the foreground, the reflection of the trees in the water, and the cascade slicing through the rocks in the middle ground. In the photo of Fasque House, Fettercairn (p.8), red deer are silhouetted, barely visible under an imposing, crisp great oak tree.
Henderson has great facility with landscape images. Sometimes they are powerful, like the Falls of Feugh (p.32), or The Cabrach (p.82), sometimes beautifully languid, such as Banchory and Scolty Hill (p.34), with its peaceful and idyllic view, or Mill of Tifty, Fyvie (p.98), or Pluscarden Abbey, near Elgin (p.126), and sometimes evocatively panoramic, for example, the River Dee at Kincardie O'Neil (p.40), Bow Fiddle Rock, Port Knockee (p.118), or Ben Rinnen, Dufftown (p.130).

The author also makes great use of harbours and ports, water both placid and turbulent, open and confined, representative of industry and commerce the old and the new, as in the photos of Peterhead Harbour (p.106) and Gardenstown, Moray (p.110).

The intersection of ancient and modern is well seen in the three images of Aberdeen: Townhouse and Union Street (p.20), the seat of the town council and law courts, where older structures are juxtaposed with people waiting for a bus. King’s College (p.22). a powerful example of late Scottish Gothic style from the late 15th century, is photographed at night, under floodlights, which updates it while making it no less impressive. Finally, a view of rural countryside in the foreground, a 16th century bridge in the middle region, and skyscrapers in the background. Through all the images contained in this book, Mr. Henderson succeeds in sharing his love for a region of Scotland he clearly knows and understands intimately.

In the introduction to The Highlands, David Paterson discusses how he has come to know and love the Highland region; a lifelong affair. A short, pertinent, and entertaining geography lesson is offered to prepare the reader for the images that follow. Paterson presents the reader with a number of different photographic ideas: landscapes and natural objects; harbours, ports, and open water; manmade edifices; and the intersection between old and new.

Mr. Paterson’s landscapes and natural imagery are always striking, with elements that are precisely descriptive and yet emotionally full. For example in Loch Tulla and the Blackmount (p.2). we see a perfectly framed image of a center island of trees in the midground, a line of pines on the terra firma behind, and imposing, snow covered mountains forming the background, all reflected in exquisite detail in the still water of the loch. In Eigg
and Rum from near Mallaig (p.30), the reader is treated to the majesty of the rough sea hurtling against the rocks with a view of strong open water to the horizon, made more striking by the threatening sky. In Glen Nevis in Winter (p.20), the fine details of alder trees with snow are intensified by the ice dotted glen running through the scene.

The interplay between the elements, especially earth and sky, is an important theme for Paterson, who uses this to show his highlands to great effect. In a bucolic scene (p.92), a flock of sheep stand patiently watching the road with mountains and hills in the background, and forbidding skies above. The photo of an isolated cottage at the mouth of Loch Stack (p.96), evokes a sense of awe with the heavens ready to open up and send torrential rains down to the earth.

Although the artist has a number of photos of modern structures, one of the more interesting images is the Harbour at Malaig (p.32), which shows the ancient industry of fishing and places it in a modern context. Nor does the photographer neglect idyllic country churchyards (p.138), or fine imposing castles, like Durobin Castle, Golspie (p.118). Mr. Paterson's goal: the reader's discovery of what he, the photographer has come to know so well, is accomplished with style and skill.

Both Mr. Henderson and Mr. Paterson are good storytellers with impressive descriptive abilities, verbally and photographically. Their landscapes transcend physical fact and often evoke strong emotional responses. Their images analyze and interpret so that we, as readers and viewers, feel compelled to look further. Finally, for readers who are students of photography, both artists have provided some notes on their technique, lenses, cameras, films, etc., and also a map, showing where each image was taken in relation to the region in question. For those who have spent time in the Grampians or the Highlands, the photos will stir up feelings and memories. For those who have not, they are a beautiful introduction.

PAMELA V. LONDON
SUNY, BUFFALO
Editor’s Note: On February 2, 1994, Scottish Tradition lost a good friend, Alison Cowan of Guelph, Ontario. Due to a much regretted error in transcription, the following review, which Ally wrote for our 1993 edition, appeared under the wrong name. We re-run the corrected version in her memory.


Postcards are ubiquitous. They have become an integral part of the holiday experience since they appeared on the British scene in 1894, their popularity mushrooming along with the increase in holiday leisure time. Bob Charnley, a former detective from Lancashire, has compiled a fascinating collection of Victorian and Edwardian specimens from Skye, the Uists and Barra in the first two books of what is to be a series of postcard tours of the Hebrides.

He has brought together a marvellous sampling not only of postcards but also of early photographs, documents and travel advertisements which make for a nostalgic and evocative journey into the past. In his research Charnley utilised his detection skills to discover the identities of those early photographers. He focussed in particular upon two companies whose work was mainly concerned with the more remote and less commercial parts of the Highlands and Islands, namely the Scholastic Souvenir Company and the Gaelic Càirt Phoistail series. In his search for the eye behind Càirt Phoistail Charnley uncovered a fascinating tale of Hebridean landlord/tenant acrimony. The Cairt photographer turned out to be none other than Archibald Chisholm, the then procurator-fiscal of North Uist who had a most tempestuous relationship with the island’s owner, Sir John Orde.

Sir John opposed the Crofters’ Act of 1886, continued to evict and harass his tenants, and was furious when Chisholm granted the tenants their legal rights under the new act. Orde evicted Chisholm and his family from their rented property and even barred him from the local hotel. The fight between the two continued for many years with bitter letters, media disputes and
a lengthy court case making it very difficult for Chisholm to carry out his duties as procurator-fiscal.

Whatever their origin, these early photographers have left us with an enlightening window on the world of stopped images. In the pictures of black houses, their chimneys smoking, one can almost smell the peat reek hanging in the air. The rapidity of their disappearance is shown in before and after photos taken just twenty years apart. Interestingly, most of the early post offices in the islands seemed to be black houses!

These books contain many memorable images - crofters cutting the peats with the croch för or fishing with tabh nets; girls gutting fish or spinning and weaving; women collecting kelp and transporting it on their backs, laden pack ponies and boats everywhere. A hardy people with marvellous faces stare solemnly back at the reader from the past, bringing back a way of life long gone.

The beautiful, timeless Hebridean landscape remains the same but the illustrations show a society in the throes of modernisation. The transformation of transport from track and pony to road and car takes place before our eyes. One great photo shows a young lady wheeling a bike along a very rocky road obviously in the process of construction. Of particular interest to feminists is the school photo of the Lamont children of Vatten, Skye. An unexpected form of reverse discrimination appears to have taken place in which Joan Lamont is beautifully dressed and shod while her brothers are unkempt and barefoot. Evidence, perhaps, for an early liberated mother?

Interspersed throughout are adverts for tours, hotel accommodation, car ferries as well as bus and boat trips to quite remote places. Modern tourists would be hard pressed to find such a variety at such reasonable prices.

Both books offer a nostalgic and evocative look at a world that is gone. For the social historian and the visitor alike these postcard tours are full of interest. Further excursions are eagerly anticipated!

**Alison Cowan**,  
**Guelph, Ontario.**