
This is a "revised edition ... which extends the scope and content of the earlier edition of 1960 (published by the then Scottish Central Library), and includes, for the first time, the extensive holdings of the National Library of Scotland" (Preface). However, the revised edition is not designated as such on the title page, and most unfortunately, does not retain the full title of its predecessor — *Scottish Family Histories held in Scottish Libraries*. Yet it continues to carry this serious limitation of scope, one of great importance to potential users. Although now containing the N.L.S. holdings and comprising "some 3,200 entries", up from the 2,000 in 1960 reported by 76 libraries, not even the holdings of the British Library are included. Sadly, only some 50 libraries in Scotland seem to have been surveyed for the present updated work. The new edition lists "printed books, pamphlets, and articles about Scottish family histories excerpted from a range of periodicals". Exactly which periodicals are covered and to what extent is not stated; such details would be very useful. The *Scottish Genealogist* is cited often. Only one reference could be found to the *Scottish-American Genealogist* and none at all to *Families* or to the *Canadian Genealogist*.

Unpublished materials of interest, such as letters or manuscripts containing family trees, histories, etc., that were noted in the libraries' responses are also included. This is a very significant advance over the earlier edition, which had been "restricted to printed books and pamphlets." But now, problems arising from the restriction in scope are of particular concern. A great many unpublished or privately printed materials may be found in major collections held by libraries in Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the United States. Some are unique, while others are not available in any of the Scottish libraries surveyed. The University of Guelph Library, for example, holds historical, manuscript and unique genealogical material among the papers of the Ewen-Grahame, Montgomery and Mickle families. Privately printed items at Guelph include the genealogy of the Canadian branch of the Galt family (on five printed leaves, ca. 1777) and the *Descendants of William Innes in Cuminestown* (compiled and printed by T.L. Innes, Mississauga, Ontario, 1983). Neither of these two items were reported by Scottish libraries and so are not recorded in Scottish Family Histories.

More serious is the curious omission of many books published in the U.K., the Commonwealth, and the United States. While the lack of J. Fraser's *Skulking for the King*, published in 1985 by the Boston Mills Press of Erin, Ontario might be understandable (survey questionnaires were returned between 1982 and 1985), how does one explain the absence of Gordon Reid's *Nest of Hornets* (Melbourne: 1982), J.K. Galbraith's *The Scotch [sic]* (Boston: 1964), J.C. Ewing's and Andrew McCallum's *Robert Graham (Twelfth of Fintry)* (Glasgow: 1931), or Alexander Fraser's *The Last Laird of Macnab* (Toronto: 1899)? The last item is especially missed, since Archibald Macnab's connection with Canada is strong, and Roland Wild's book, *Macnab, the Last Laird* (London: 1938) is included. Indeed, when it comes to the Macnabs the problem is glaring. There are at least six books on Sir Allan Napier Macnab (1798–1862) and his family in Canada (Macnab of Dundurn), that were published between 1900 and 1971 and that are all unrecorded in *Scottish Family Histories*. Can it be that none of the books noted above are
held by any of the libraries checked, even the N.L.S.? Readers are warned that biographies of individuals are excluded unless "they contain sufficient information about their families to justify inclusion as family histories." In spite of this limitation and its imprecise nature, it is more likely that these omissions reflect not cross-checking standard bibliographical tools, and instead relying solely on the survey returns. This may also explain the failure to include works on the Foulis and Chambers families, both important Scottish publishers, while listing similar works on the Black, Blackie, Blackwood, Collins and Macmillan families (though even these are not complete).

On the bright side, the quarto format and improved layout of this edition are much better than that of 1960, which was in octavo. Catchwords have been added and the typography is clear and easy to scan. The volume is well bound, servicable and a bargain at the price. There is no author or title index, a defect continued from the older edition, and the arrangement of entries is alphabetical by family names. Where more than one family is included in a work, it is entered under each appropriate name, although there is an unfortunate lack of consistency in this regard. Very little information is given as to the meanings of abbreviations and certain notes, such as "unconfirmed location". Each entry must be examined very carefully in order to determine whether it is a published work, a manuscript or typescript, a collection of family papers, etc. Here too, inconsistent use of various notations compounds the problems. Further inconsistencies exist in the laudable attempt to rectify the 1960 edition's conscious omission of those holdings of the Edinburgh University Library as reported in the latter's Catalogue of the Printed Books ... (3 vols., 1918–1923). And there are still other problems, such as the author of Annals of Such Patriots ... Family of Fraser ... (Edinburgh: 1795) being listed as Archibald Simson, his patronymic, when internationally recognized reference sources (including the above-mentioned, Catalogue of the Printed Books ...) have established his name as Archibald Campbell Fraser (1736–1815).

As in the 1960 edition, there is a very useful Appendix which contains more general works on Scottish family history. This is not mentioned in the preface or introduction (both dated June, 1986), nor in the scope notes, and as there is no table of contents (unlike the first edition), it might well be missed by a user. It has doubled in size from 1960, and now has 200 entries. Strangely, some titles have been dropped for no apparent reason, thus requiring continued use of the earlier edition. Close examination of the 1986 Appendix (arranged alphabetically by author) also shows some curious and disturbing omissions. Donald Whyte's 1984 publication, Scottish Ancestry Research (Morgantown, West Virginia) is present, while his important and long awaited Dictionary of Scottish Emigrants to Canada Before Confederation (Toronto: Ontario Genealogical Society, 1986) is not even noted as being "forthcoming" or "in press". Again, P. William Filby's first three volume Passenger and Immigration List Index (Detroit: 1981) is listed (oddly enough) under title, while the supplements, published annually from 1982 on and now totaling almost twice as many names as the original set, are not mentioned at all. Nor does the Appendix record Filby's important Passenger and Immigration Lists Bibliography, 1538–1900 (Detroit: 1981), which has been supplemented once already (Detroit: 1984).

The front flap of the dust jacket notes that "Scottish Family Histories is the standard reference tool for genealogists and family historians who seek up-to-date sources for the latest information on Scottish family history." In fact, its limitations of scope and libraries
surveyed, lack of completeness and indexing, inconsistencies and errors all serve to de-preciate its claimed value. Nevertheless, it is unique in its field and represents a distinct advance over its predecessor, just as the latter was a step forward from M. Stuart’s and J.B. Paul’s *Scottish Family History* (1930, reprinted Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing, 1983 and still in print). This review, though highly critical of current shortcomings, is intended to encourage the enterprise to advance still further and looks forward to the next, truly improved and revised edition.

*Bernard Katz*

*University of Guelph*